

**SALT LAKE CITY  
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION**

**REQUEST BY WELLINGTON WEBB TO CONSTRUCT AN APPROXIMATELY  
FORTY FOOT (40') TALL AMATEUR RADIO FACILITY ON THE SUBJECT  
PROPERTY LOCATED AT 317 NO. 'N' STREET, IN THE AVENUES HISTORIC  
DISTRICT**

**CASE NO. 470-06-52  
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2007**

**OVERVIEW**

The applicant, Wellington Webb is requesting approval to construct an amateur radio facility to the rear of the house located at 317 No. 'N' Street. The property is located in the Avenues Historic District, which was locally designated as a historic district in March of 1978. The base zoning of the property is SR-1A, Special Development Pattern Residential, the purpose of which is "to maintain the unique character of older, predominantly single-family neighborhoods that display a variety of yard, lot sizes and bulk characteristics." The zone allows single-family and twin homes as permitted uses.



## BACKGROUND AND PROPOSAL

According to the historic site form completed in 1979, this one-story brick bungalow was built in 1919, probably from a pattern book design, by Raymond Cole. The applicant proposes to place a freestanding forty foot (40') amateur radio tower in the rear yard of the subject property in order to send and receive long-distance radio transmissions. The self-supporting galvanized steel triangular structure with tubular legs and angle cross bracing would be placed on an 8' x 8' concrete pad.

## ANALYSIS

### REQUIREMENTS OF THE ZONING ORDINANCE

#### ZONING REQUIREMENTS

Section 21A.40.090 of the Zoning Ordinance provides general regulations, applicable to all zoning districts, for accessory uses, buildings and structures. As per this section, specific standards must be met for the requested amateur radio facility. Any antenna having a combined surface area greater than ten (10) square feet or having any single dimension exceeding twelve feet (12') that is capable of transmitting as well as receiving signals and is licensed by the federal communications commission as an amateur radio facility shall be permitted as an accessory use, but must met the following regulations:

- 1. **Number Limited:** No more than one such antenna or antenna support structure with a surface area greater than ten (10) square feet or any single dimension exceeding twelve feet (12') may be located on any lot.*
- 2. **Height Limited:** No such antenna and its support structure shall, if ground mounted, exceed seventy five feet (75) in height or, if attached to a building pursuant to subsection D3 of this section, the height therein specified.*

**FINDING:** The proposed accessory structure complies with the antenna regulations of the ordinance.

#### ZONING ORDINANCE AND DESIGN GUIDELINES

*21A.34.020 H Historic Preservation Overlay District:*

*G. Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness for Alteration of a Landmark Site or Contributing Structure. In considering an application for a certificate of appropriateness for alteration of a landmark site or contributing structure, the historic landmark commission, or the planning director, for administrative decisions, shall find that the project substantially complies with all of the following general standards that pertain to the application and that the decision is in the best interest of the city:*

1. *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be used for a purpose that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment;*

**FINDING:** No changes are proposed in the use of the building for residential purposes. The proposed project is consistent with this standard.

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;*

Established design guidelines offer the following guidance on the preservation of character-defining elements.

### **Design Standards for Additions**

**8.1 Design an addition to a historic structure such that it will not destroy or obscure historically important architectural features.** For example, loss or alteration of architectural details, cornices and eavelines should be avoided.

**FINDING:** The proposed accessory structure will be placed toward the rear of the subject property so that it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way and not damage or obscure character defining features of the historic property.

3. *All sites, structures and objects shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create a false sense of history or architecture are not allowed;*

**DISCUSSION:** The contemporary nature of the proposed amateur radio facility distinguishes it from the original historic portion of the house. The design guidelines recommend the following with respect to the design of an addition.

### **Standards for Additions**

**8.4 Design a new addition to be recognized as a product of its own time.**

An addition shall be made distinguishable from the historic building, while also remaining visually compatible with these earlier features. A change in setbacks of the addition from the historic building, a subtle change in material, or a differentiation between historic and more current styles are all techniques that may be considered to help define a change from old to new construction. Creating a jog in the foundation between the original building and the addition also may establish a more sound structural design to resist earthquake damage, while helping to define it as a later addition.

**8.6 Do not construct a new addition or alteration that will hinder one's ability to interpret the historic character of the building or structure.** A new addition that creates an appearance inconsistent with the historic character of the building is inappropriate. An alteration that seeks to imply an earlier period than that of the building is inappropriate. In addition, an alteration that seeks to imply an inaccurate variation on the historic style is inappropriate. An alteration that covers historically significant features is inappropriate as well.

**FINDING:** The proposed new construction will be recognizable as a product of its own time and is consistent with this standard.

*4. Alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved;*

**FINDING:** The removal of alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right is not part of this request.

*5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved;*

Established design guidelines offer the following guidance on retaining the historic character of a property.

#### **Design Standards for Additions**

**8.2 Design an addition to be compatible in size and scale with the main building.** Set back an addition from historically important primary facades in order to allow the original proportions and character to remain prominent. Keep the addition visually subordinate to the historic building. If it is necessary to design an addition that is taller than the historic building, set it back substantially from significant facades and use a "connector" to link it.

**FINDING:** Significant architectural details will not be removed, damaged or covered by the installation of the antenna, consistent with this standard.

*6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced wherever feasible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures or objects;*

**FINDING:** Repair or replacement of missing architectural features is not a component of this request.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible;*

**FINDING:** No chemical or physical treatments are proposed as part of this project.

8. *Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant cultural, historical, architectural or archaeological material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment;*

**DISCUSSION:** Staff is concerned about minimizing any potential negative visual impacts of the proposed antenna on the property and historic area. The Commission may wish to consider to what extent it is appropriate to restrict the height of the facility, other less visible locations and appropriate screening as viewed from the street with the applicant.

The subject property is next to the eastern boundary of the historic district. The City Cemetery located to the east of the property is thus located outside the historic district boundary. The surrounding buildings are a mix of one- to two-story buildings exhibiting a typical range of styles, forms and materials. The four Victorian style homes adjacent to the subject property to the south, range in height from one- to one-and-a-half-stories. A one-and-a-half-story brick Victorian cottage is located to the west. To the north of the subject property, is a one-story brick Bungalow with a hip roof.

The design guidelines offer the following guidance for constructing a compatible accessory structure:

### **General Design Standards**

**12.4 Minimize the visual impacts of mechanical equipment as seen from the public way.** Screen mechanical equipment from view. Screen ground mounted units with fences, stone walls, or hedges. Where rooftop units are visible, provide screening with materials that are compatible with those of the building itself. Do not locate window air conditioning units in the primary façade. Use low-profile units on rooftops so they will not be visible for the street or alley. Also minimize the visual impact of utility connections and service boxes. Use smaller satellite dishes and mount them low to the ground away from front yards, significant building facades or highly visible roof planes when feasible. Use muted colors on telecommunications and mechanical equipment that will minimize their appearance by blending with their background.

**FINDING:** Negative visual impacts are anticipated from the additional height of the proposed facility at this location.

9. *Additions or alterations to structures and objects shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible in massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment;*

**DISCUSSION:** The Design Guidelines offer the following guidance for constructing new additions:

### **Design Standards for Additions**

**8.3 Place an addition at the rear of a building or set it back from the front to minimize the visual impact on the historic structure and to allow the original proportions and character to remain prominent.** Locating an addition at the front of a structure is inappropriate.

**8.7 When planning an addition to a building, preserve historic alignments that may exist on the street.** Some roof lines and porch eaves on historic buildings in the area may align at approximately the same height. An addition shall not be placed in a location where these relationships would be altered or obscured.

**8.9 Minimize negative technical effects to original features when designing an addition.** Avoid construction methods, for example that would cause vibration that may damage historic foundations. New alterations also should be designed in such a way that they can be removed without destroying original materials or features.

**FINDING:** The new work will be discernable from the old and it would be possible to remove the accessory structure without compromising the integrity of the historic residence. The proposed project is consistent with this standard.

10. *Certain building materials are prohibited including the following:*

*a. Vinyl or aluminum cladding when applied directly to an original or historic material, and*

*b. Any other imitation siding material designed to look like wood siding but fabricated from an imitation material or materials;*

**FINDING:** No prohibited building materials are proposed.

11. *Any new sign and any change in the appearance of any existing sign located on a landmark site or within the H historic preservation overlay district, which is visible from any public way or open space shall be consistent with the historic character of the landmark site or H historic preservation overlay district and shall comply with the standards outlined in Part IV, Chapter 21A.46, Signs;*

**FINDING:** Signage is not a component of this project.

12. *Additional design standards adopted by the historic landmark commission and city council.*

**DISCUSSION:** Generally, local jurisdictions may not regulate amateur radio antennas structures in such a way as to preclude amateur service communications. Thus aesthetic controls, such as regulations on placement, screening or height, must reasonably accommodate such antennas. Specific guidelines that are applicable in this case are noted in the discussion of each standard.

**FINDING:** The proposed project is less consistent with standard 8 as noted above. The Commission may wish to consider to what extent it is appropriate to restrict the height of the facility, other less visible locations, appropriate screening as viewed from the street and other mitigation measures with the applicant.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Based upon the analysis and findings of fact noted above, Planning Staff recommends the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request subject to:

1. Approval of the final details of the design of the proposed project, including location, size, color, and screening shall be delegated to Planning Staff based upon direction given during the hearing from the Historic Landmark Commission.
2. The proposed amateur radio facility shall be located to the rear of the existing principal building on the subject property to minimize its visibility from the street.
3. The final landscape plan including specific details for effectively screening the equipment shall be approved by the Planning Staff.
4. This approval is for **design** only. The project must meet all other applicable city codes and ordinances prior to issuance of a building permit.

Janice Lew  
Planning Division  
January 31, 2007

**Attachments:** Exhibit 1: Photographs  
Exhibit 2: Submittal



# **Exhibit 1**

## **Photographs**

**Exhibit 2  
Submittal**

## **Exhibit 3 Photographs**

**Exhibit 3**  
**Photographs**

**Exhibit 4**  
**Approved Rehabilitation Plans**

