### **MEMORANDUM**

451 South State Street, Room 406 Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 (801) 535-7757



**TO:** Historic Landmark Commission

FROM: Janice Lew, Principal Planner

**DATE:** April 12, 2007

CC: George Shaw, Planning Director

**Cheri Coffey, Deputy Planning Director** 

**Project File** 

SUBJECT: Case No. 470-07-11 – A demolition request by Richard Rasmuson for the

building located at 1328 E. 200 South Street.

This memorandum presents the reasoning behind Planning Staff's determination that the building referenced above is a non-contributing building in the University Historic District. The determination was made in conjunction with the applicant's proposal to demolish the building and construct an addition to the University Pharmacy building, the adjacent property to the west. The Planning Director has elected to refer this demolition application to the Commission since public input objecting to the request has been received (See Exhibit 3).

### Requirements of the Zoning Ordinance for Demolition of a Non-Contributing Building

Section 21A.34.020 H Historic Preservation Overlay District specifies an administrative review process for demolition requests of non-contributing structures under subsection 21A.34.020(F). An application for demolition of a non-contributing structure requires notice of determination of a non-contributing site's status pursuant to subsection 21A.10.020F of this title. At the end of a fourteen (14) day notice period, the planning director shall either issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition or refer the application to the Historic Landmark Commission. Prior to approval of any Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition, the Historic Landmark Commission shall review post demolition plans to assure that the plans are consistent with the standards of subsection H of this section of the Zoning Ordinance.

The Zoning Ordinance addresses the determination of contributing and non-contributing status in two places: Definitions (21A.34.020B2 and 3) and Criteria for Selection of an H Historic Preservation Overlay District or Landmark Site (21A.34.020C2). The Ordinance cites three criteria for determining the contributing or non-contributing status of a property within a historic district: historical or architectural significance, physical integrity and the age of the site. Subsection C2, as referenced in the definition, requires that to be considered a

contributing structure, a site must be at least fifty years old, or have achieved significance within the past fifty years, if the property is of exceptional importance.

In a letter to the applicant dated March 9, 2007 and attached to this memorandum as Exhibit 1, Planning Staff presented an evaluation of the property and the reasoning behind the determination of the building as non-contributing. As such, the Planning Division sent notice to surrounding property owners within eighty-five feet of the property and the Historic Landmark Commission members. The notice informed the recipients of the non-contributing status of the subject property and that a demolition application has been submitted. Although not required by ordinance, Staff sent copies of the notice to members of the community who contacted staff about the project. Comments of interested parties objecting to the request are attached to this memorandum as Exhibit 3. In this case, the Planning Director has elected to refer the demolition application to the Commission for consideration.

#### **Conclusion of Status**

In the context of the University Historic District commercial area, the wood-frame building that appears in the 1936 tax photograph could be considered part of the broader pattern of development, as it would meet the age requirement and was constructed within the historic period. However, major alterations have compromised the building's physical integrity in terms of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. The building no longer illustrates, through distinctive characteristics, the identity associated with its historic significance. These alterations are not reversible without complete replacement of building fabric. Thus, it is the Planning Division's determination that the building meets the definition of a non-contributing structure as defined by the Zoning Ordinance.

#### Recommendation

Based upon an evaluation of the property located at 1328 East 200 South Street that was presented in the March 9, 2007 document attached as Exhibit 1, Planning Staff recommends the following:

- 1. The Historic Landmark Commission affirms Planning Staff's determination that the building located at 1328 East 200 South Street does not meet the criteria outlined in subsection 21A.34.020C2 Criteria for Selection of an H Historic Preservation Overlay District or Landmark Site, and as such is a non-contributing structure in the University Historic District.
- 2. Prior to approval of any Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition, the Historic Landmark Commission shall review and approve a post-demolition plan for the site.

Attachments: Exhibit 1 – Determination of Non-Contributing Status

Exhibit 2 – Historical Documentation

Exhibit 3 – Public Input

# **Exhibit 1 Determination of Non-Contributing Status**

### **Exhibit 2 Historical Documentation**

# Exhibit 3 Public Input