

**SALT LAKE CITY  
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION  
Minutes of the Meeting  
Held at 451 South State Street, Room 126  
December 6, 2006**

A field trip preceded the meeting and was attended by Commission Members David Fitzsimmons, Pete Ashdown, Paula Carl, and Noreen Heid as well as Planning Staff members Cheri Coffey and Lex Traugher. A quorum was not present; therefore, minutes were not taken.

Present from the Historic Landmark Commission were Chairperson Fitzsimmons, Commissioner Ashdown, Commissioner Carl, Commissioner Christensen, Commissioner Heid, and Commissioner Haymond. Commissioner Lloyd arrived to the meeting at 4:30 p.m. Commissioner Hunter was not present.

Present from the Planning Staff were Cheri Coffey, Deputy Planning Director, Joel Paterson, Planning Program Supervisor, Louise Harris, Senior Secretary, and Kathryn Weiler, Senior Secretary. Chairperson Fitzsimmons called the meeting to order at 3:57 p.m.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons announced that each item would be reviewed in the same order as listed on the agenda. Chairperson Fitzsimmons asked that all cellular telephones and pagers be turned off so there will be no disruption during the meeting.

An agenda was mailed to the pertinent people and was posted in the appropriate locations in the building, in accordance with the open meeting law. A roll is being kept with the minutes of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission meeting. The minutes are presented in agenda order, not necessarily as items were presented at the Historic Landmark Commission meeting. Compact Discs (CDs) of the meeting will be retained in the Commission office for a period of one year, after which they will be erased.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons inquired if all Commissioners had the opportunity to visit sites that would be the subject of discussion at this meeting. The Commissioners indicated that they had visited the site.

**WORK SESSION (4:00 P.M.)**

Chairperson Fitzsimmons turned the floor to Cheri Coffey to discuss various issues.

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSIONERS**

Ms. Coffey expressed the need for more applications from prospective Commissioners.

Commissioner Heid wanted to know if applicants needed to live within the Historic District that they would represent.

Ms. Coffey explained that they must be qualified and meet the guidelines in the zoning ordinance. She suggested that the Historic Landmark Commission draft a letter to the Mayor explaining the urgent need for members. They could elaborate on the current situation of having members whose terms have expired, but allowed to function in this body by the Attorney's Office as a result of the desperate need for members.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons agreed to draft the letter, which would be addressed to Mayor Rocky Anderson. The letter would express the urgent need for Historic Landmark Commissioners and request that more are appointed.

The Commissioners agreed to think of prospective applicants and encourage them to fill out an application for the Historic Landmark Commission. The seats for the Avenues, Capitol Hill, and South Temple Historic Districts, as well as the representative of the Utah Heritage Foundation are vacant.

### **MEETING DATE**

Ms. Coffey informed the Commission that the July meeting date would not be on the first Wednesday of the month due to a conflict with the July 4, 2007, Holiday. Consequentially, the meeting for July will be held on July 18, 2007.

### **RETREAT**

The Commission agreed to meet on January 17, 2007, from 4:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. for the annual retreat. Ms. Coffey asked the Commissioners to suggest agenda items. Commissioners were instructed to email their suggestions to the Chair. The retreat is advertised and open to the public.

### **PRESERVATION PROJECT FUNDING**

Ms. Coffey referred to a memo relating to funding allocation for preservation projects this fiscal year. The memo is attached to these minutes. City Council has allocated \$341,000.00 this fiscal year in response to constituent requests that their properties be incorporated into Historic Districts. There is a need to do a preservation plan and surveys of all of the Historic Districts.

The funds released by the City Council can be used to hire consultants to oversee various projects. Planning Staff are currently reviewing Request for Proposals (RFPs) from contractors for surveys as well as creating and overseeing a Preservation Plan.

### **PRESERVE AMERICA**

Last year Salt Lake City was declared a Preserve America Community. Matching fund grants are available in the amount of \$20,000.00 to \$150,000.00. The funds must be used for preservation projects, such as feasibility studies, markers in streets which will restore the old street names, and surveys that relate to preservation tourism. The funds may not be used for actual physical construction.

Prior to application submission, the City Council will need to pass a resolution stating that they will accept the Preserve America Funds and ensure allocation of the matching funds. Applications for the Preserve America Grants must be received at the Federal headquarters by February 14, 2007. Ms. Coffey further explained that the matching funds can't come from Federal block grants, with the exception of the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds.

Commissioner Heid expressed an interest in considering Highland Park for designation as a City Historical District.

Ms. Coffey explained that Highland Park is currently a National Historic District. More intensive level surveys may be needed before it can be considered for a local Historic District. The preservation plan is a priority. The preservation plan will tell the Historic Landmark Commission what areas should be considered for Historic Districts.

The Wasatch Plunge has undergone a Level One Feasibility Study to determine if it would be practical to restore the building back into a Community Recreation Center. The Public Services Director has the study and will meet with the City Council to review the

findings of the report and determine whether the next phase of study should be undertaken.

#### NEW PROJECTS TO CONSIDER FOR THE RETREAT

Both the Preserve America Grant and the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) can be used for training, to open dialogue channels, and similar activities.

The Commissioners agreed that the City Building Inspectors do not typically check on the plans to make sure contractors have complied with the parameters of the approved plans. As a result, the possibility exists for structures that do not meet the Historic guidelines to pass inspection. The Commission agreed that there is a need for further training of building inspectors or creating a Landmark Inspector position. The position would fall under the supervision of the Planning Office rather than building inspector's office.

The Commission noted their desire to discuss Compatible Infill regulations and when it is okay to allow exceptions to those rules for preservation purposes.

#### COMMENTS TO THE COMMISSION (4:30 P.M.)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons stated that comments would be taken on any issues affecting the historic districts and historic preservation in Salt Lake City.

Cindy Cromer, 816 East 100 South, submitted a memo which was previously sent to the Planning Commission for their consideration. Ms. Cromer is asking that the Commission change the way that staff reports are written. She expressed the opinion that staff reports should be written with both supporting and opposing findings. Including opposing arguments would allow the Boards additional information and verbiage if they chose to oppose a petition or set conditions.

Steve McGowin, 1235 South 1200 East, stated that he had a pending lawsuit against the City regarding ongoing concern with the adequacy of public notification. He referenced a proposal before the Commission that was noticed as a garage, but did not include information explaining that the garage did not already exist nor mention the applicant's other request to the City for a hobby shop in the proposed garage. He stated that the notices seem to discourage public input. He also mentioned that he is appealing his lawsuit to the Utah Supreme Court.

#### REPORT FROM THE PLANNING DIRECTOR

Ms. Coffey had no further issues to report at this time.

#### DISCUSSION OF THE MINUTES (4:34 P.M.)

Commissioner Hunter, who was not present at this meeting, contacted the Chair via email and requested corrections to the November 1, 2006 minutes. Commissioner Christensen and Commissioner Lloyd requested additional changes to the minutes.

**Commissioner Christensen moved that the Historic Landmark Commission table the minutes of the November 1, 2006 meeting until the Historic Landmark Commission meets in January 2007 in order for the issues that have been brought up in discussion of these past minutes to be addressed including the corrections suggested by Commissioner Hunter. Commissioner Lloyd seconded the motion, all voted aye; the motion passed.**

**PUBLIC HEARING**

Case No. 470-06-50, by Trolley Square, LLC, represented by Mark Blancarte of Blake Hunt Ventures, requesting approval for a rooftop skylight dome located at 602 East 500 South at Trolley Square. The dome will be installed in the central interior crossing in this building and provide a passage for natural light. Trolley Square is individually listed as a Landmark Site on the Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources and is located in the Central City Historic District. The Trolley Square complex is zoned CS (Community Shopping District). (Staff – Lex Traughber at 535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com)

*(This item was heard at 4:42 p.m.)*

Mr. Lex Traughber, Staff Planner, presented the Staff Report by outlining the major issues of the case, the findings of fact, and the staff's recommendation, a copy of which was filed with the minutes.

The following is an overview of the project:

Trolley Square, LLC is requesting approval for a rooftop skylight dome located at the above referenced address in Trolley Square. The dome will be installed in the central interior crossing in this building and provide a passage for natural light. Trolley Square is individually listed as a Landmark Site on the Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources and is located in the Central City Historic District. The Trolley Square complex is zoned CS (Community Shopping District). The purpose of the CS District is to provide an environment for an efficient and attractive shopping center development at a community service level.

The property is Turn of the Century masonry architecture. It was originally used as trolley barns and later remodeled into a shopping center consisting of four main buildings known as A,B,C, and D. The structure is in good repair and does not need major changes. The petitioner is seeking to modify the building to better suit the function.

The applicant, Mark Blancarte of Blake Hunt Ventures, is requesting approval for a rooftop skylight dome. The dome would be set back from the facades of building D fronting 700 East and 600 South by 200 feet and 177 feet respectively. Measurement from ground level to the top of the dome is approximately forty seven feet. A drum structure will sit over a base to fit between existing struts and gables and the seventeen foot six inch radius dome that exist now. Height from the base of platform to the peak is twenty five feet. A portion of the gable section will be removed to allow for the dome structure. The roofing material will be of zinc with a frame constructed from steel concrete. There will be mullions between the glass and a clearstory around the dome. The effect of the dome from street level of dome should be negligible. The barrel vaulted roof is a future consideration and not to be considered in this meeting.

Subsection 21A. 34.020(G) of the Historic Preservation Overlay District Chapter of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance addresses standards for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration of a landmark site or contributing structure. There are eleven standards in that subsection, three of those standards apply as outlined in the staff report.

Based on the discussion and findings of fact as noted in the staff report, Planning Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposed dome and delegate final approval to the Planning Director with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall submit detailed architectural drawings of the proposed dome noting dimensions and specific building materials to Planning Staff.
- 2) The final approval of the dome shall ensure that the scale and height of the dome is such that it is not readily visible from the streets surrounding the block, and does not detract from the historic roof parapet features of the building.

- 3) Any appeal of the Planning Director's final decision regarding the proposed dome structure shall be referred back to the Historic Landmark Commission for consideration.

**THE CHAIR CALLED THE APPLICANT TO ADDRESS COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS (4:58 P.M.)**

Mr. Christensen asked if the concrete would be removed on other existing skylights. The applicant responded that that would be up to the future tenants.

Seeing no further questions from the Staff, the Chair opened the hearing to the public and asked if anyone wished to address the commission.

Cindy Cromer, property owner in the Central City Historic District was excited about the proposed reinvestment in Trolley Square and was not opposed to the concept of the skylight. Her concerns related to the view from a higher elevation, particularly that of the east elevation. She expressed the desire that the finalized design come back before the Commission rather than before the Planning Director, otherwise there would not be a public notice issued.

Upon hearing no further comments from the audience, Chairperson Fitzsimmons closed the hearing to the public and the Historical Landmark Commission proceeded into the executive session portion of the meeting.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION (5:11)**

Staff requested measurements from the bottom of the trough of the gable to the peak of the dome. They also wanted a clearer description of the materials that would be used for the construction. The project as presented before the body was still in a conceptual format.

**MOTION**

**Regarding case No. 470-06-50, Commissioner Carl moved for that Historic Landmark Commission grant conceptual approval and requires the applicant to return to the full Commission with final design, including detailing the final materials, providing a colored drawing of dome and supporting structure along with fenestration details.**

**Commissioner Heid seconded the motion.**

**Commissioner Lloyd requested an amendment to the motion that the skylight peak elevation must not exceed more than forty five feet above grade. The amendment was accepted, all voted aye; the motion passed.**

**OTHER BUSINESS (5:23 p.m.)**

Mr. Blancarte requested the opportunity to present additional information to the Commission relating to other aspects of the project, hoping for feedback. Staff recommended that, because the items Mr. Blancarte wanted to discuss were not properly noticed, the Commission should refrain from comment. Staff is available to give suggestions and feedback to the applicant.

Beatrice Lufkin made a PowerPoint presentation, regarding the South Temple Historic District Reconnaissance Survey. A copy of the presentation will be included with the minutes and on the Historic Landmark Commission website with the comment that the updated survey is available in the Planning Division office.

There being no further business, a motion was made by Commissioner Lloyd to adjourn the meeting at 5:56 p.m.

---

Louise Harris, Recording Secretary

---

Kathryn Weiler, Historic Landmark Commission Secretary

---

Dave Fitzsimmons, Chairperson