

**SALT LAKE CITY
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
Minutes of the Meeting
Held at 451 South State Street, Room 126
August 2, 2006**

A field trip preceded the meeting and was attended by Commission Members: Paula Carl, Scott Christensen; Acting Chairperson, David Fitzsimmons, Noreen Hammond-Heid, Creed Haymond and Esther Hunter. Planning Staff present were Joel Paterson, Planning Programs Supervisor and Elizabeth Giraud, Senior Planner

MINUTES FOR THE FIELD TRIP (3:00 p.m.)

Case No. 470-06-22 at 500 & 600 North and Arctic Court and 300 West

The Commission did not visit this site as they had seen it on a previous field trip.

Case No. 026-04 at 466 North Wall

Ms. Giraud identified the site and described the request, the past approval on site and reason why the project is returning to the Historic Landmark Commission. They discussed the proposed change of materials from stone to EIFS.

Case No. 470-06-38 at 1840 South 800 East

Ms. Giraud presented information on a proposed National Register nomination and requested that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation to the Board of State History. The Commission asked whether the windows were original.

Case No. 470-06-39 at 175 North Main Street

Ms. Giraud presented information on a proposed National Register nomination and requested that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation to the Board of State History.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING (4:05 p.m.)

Historic Landmark Commission Members present at the meeting were: Scott Christensen; Acting Chair, Paula Carl, David Fitzsimmons, Noreen Hammond-Heid, Warren Lloyd, Creed Haymond and Esther Hunter. Planning Staff present were: Alexander Ikefuna, Planning Director; Joel Paterson, Planning Programs Supervisor; Elizabeth Giraud, Senior Planner and Louise Harris, Secretary.

Chairperson Christensen called the meeting to order.

Comments to the Commission

No one from the public had comments to make to the Commission.

Report by the Planning Director

Mr. Ikefuna indicated he did not have comments for this meeting.

Approval of the Minutes of July 5, 2006

Additions or corrections: Commissioner Christensen made the following corrections:

Page 8 change the second paragraph from "There had been two garages there but they are now gone".

To read: "There had been two garages there but **one is** now gone".

Page 11, change paragraph 13 from "Ms. Giraud indicated that it would come to this Commission but she would not administratively approve two steel doors that have been suggested to replace the old ones".

To read: "Ms. Giraud indicated that it would come to this Commission but she would not administratively approve two steel doors **should they be** suggested to replace the old ones".

Commissioner Carl moved to approve the minutes as corrected, Seconded by Commissioner Hammond-Heid. All voted "Aye", the motion passed.

PUBLIC HEARING

Case No. 470-06-22 a request by Howa Capitol for final review to construct a new mixed-use development between 500 North and 600 North and Arctic Court and 300 West, consisting of two five-story buildings with retail uses in the main story and dwelling units above; a single-story grocery store; and eleven townhouse units. This property is located in the Capitol Hill Historic District. (Staff Elizabeth Giraud 535-8128 or elizabethgiraud@slcgov.com)

(This item was heard at 4:07p.m.)

Commissioner Fitzsimmons indicated that because he works with the architect and even though he is not directly involved with this case, he should recuse himself from the hearing of this case. Commissioner Christensen indicated that because there still would be a quorum present it would be okay for Commissioner Fitzsimmons to leave the room. Commissioner Christensen then asked the opinions of the other Commissioners. Mr. Ikefuna, Planning Director, indicated that the Commissioner should be recused. Commissioner Fitzsimmons left the room.

Ms. Giraud presented a memorandum stating that at the Historic Landmark Commission meeting of June 7, 2006, Howa Capital requested approval and was granted conceptual approval of the subject property also known as the "commercial node." At the June 7 meeting, there also was a request by the Historic Landmark Commission that more details be presented. She further explained that at the direction of the Planning Division Staff, the Historic Landmark Commission review the IBI Design Guidelines within the context of *21A.34.020.H, Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness Involving New Construction or Alteration of a Noncontributing Structure*. The IBI Guidelines do not affect the City's Design Guidelines in the ordinance and that they are used primarily for marketing purposes to attract potential developers but are included in the memorandum. She further felt the architects could explain the different materials that were being proposed. Ms. Giraud did not give a recommendation because this case had already been approved and the hearing is to present additional details.

Commissioner Christensen asked how specific IBI guidelines are in expressing recommended or acceptable materials.

Ms. Giraud indicated they give a range of materials such as window types, and are intended as a guideline.

A copy of the staff memorandum is attached with these minutes.

Commissioner Christensen invited the applicants to come forward and state their names.

Dru Damico; Howa Capital, Prescott Muir; Architect and Aaron Hansen; Architect came forward. Mr. Muir had a color board with samples of the brick, window frames, the type of shingles and various other materials that will be used. The stucco material is called Hard Coat and will be used on the penthouse units. Small metal awnings also will be used on the penthouse units of building "D" and "A" and will match in color. The second, third and fourth floors will be brick. The brick is a face brick that will match the color of the West High School brick and is manufactured at Interstate Brick. As a Leed Certified building the developers are trying to buy as many materials locally as possible. The retail level will have a concrete face with fabric awnings matching the penthouse in color. The windows are vertical and will continue the historic flavor of the structure.

Mr. Muir continued with the townhouses, stating that they would have a lighter red brick. They showed the Commission a natural finished hardiboard that will be used as a horizontal plank format that will be used primarily on the garages, around the entry, and in the townhouse proper. Each entry will have canopies.

The configuration of the plaza will have trees with garden spaces. Trees scapes will be along the borders of the property with small platters. The development meets the Zoning Ordinance criteria for the percentage of green space both in the public right-of-way and on the property. The developers hope to build a walk way for access to the retail shops instead of traveling through the parking area.

Commissioner Hunter asked about the materials of the windows. Mr. Muir indicated they would be a painted aluminum. It will look like a painted wood window and will give a durability of a metal window with residential character of a painted surface.

Commissioner Christensen commented that he liked the color of the brick on the 300 West frontage as it picks up the color of West High. The housing has a different shade of brick so that it reads as something different from the rest of the complex.

Commissioner Lloyd is pleased that this project will be beneficial for the Capitol Hill Historic District in terms that it will create a center of activity and use for the area. He added that the north area of Salt Lake City has not seen traffic like this and it is hopeful this will build a more inviting community.

Commissioner Carl moved that in Case Number 470-06-22 that final approval be given for this project. Commissioner Lloyd seconded. All voted "Aye". The motion passed.

Case No. 026-04, at approximately 466 North Wall Street, a request by Dr. Joel Ehrenkrantz, represented by Allen Roberts, of CRS Architects to use scored stucco instead of stone and reduce the height of the rear elevation of a single-family house approved for construction by the Historic Landmark Commission on October 20, 2004. This property is located in the Capitol Hill Historic District. (Staff Elizabeth Giraud 535-8128 or elizabethgiraud@slcgov.com)

(This case was heard at 4:29 p.m.)

Ms. Giraud indicated that the applicant received approval to clad the home with Red Butte sandstone veneer, cast stone quoins and lintels but due to the financial considerations the applicant is proposing the following changes:

- The Red Butte sandstone is replaced with a synthetic, exterior plaster.
- The cast stone lintels and quoins are replaced with one of two options:
 1. Shaped foam, or
 2. An incised (scored) pattern in the stucco
- The rear (east) half of the house is reduced from two stories to one story.
- The metal railing on the front porch is replaced by a synthetic stucco wall, a continuation of the wall below.
- The shaped lintels with surrounds on the front of the dwelling are replaced with flat lintels, like those on the other elevations.
- The chimney is removed.
- Cedar shingles are replaced with “weathered wood” asphalt shingles.

The most significant change is the wall material. The Historic Landmark Commission has approved stucco, both the true and the synthetic variety, for several-family structures in historic districts in the past.

The plans of the house were submitted to the Building Services Division prior to the adoption of the Compatible Residential Infill Development Ordinance, the Building Official determined that the proposed house can be reviewed under the requirements of the prior zoning requirements for the SR-1 Zoning District.

Because this project is vested under the old ordinance, staff gave the applicant the choice to utilize the new Compatible Residential Infill Ordinance or utilize the prior SR-1 standards. Dr. Ehrenkrantz chose to stay with the old ordinance.

Based upon the previous approval and the adherence to the standards of the Zoning Ordinance, Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the revisions to the proposed dwelling. This approval is for design only.

Commissioner Christensen asked if there were any questions from the Commissioners for Ms. Giraud. Seeing none, he invited Allen Roberts to come forward.

Mr. Roberts indicated that the 25 foot rear yard setback has been changed to 30 feet. In the original presentation they were over-budgeted and now are coming back with a new scaled down building. The tower is gone, the floor area has been reduced by 1000 square feet, the bedroom and bath from the second level has been removed lowering the height. The footprint for the height and width is the same as before. There were two options of detail for the scoring of the quoins,

lintels and sills. Their choice is the slightly projecting quoins, sills and lintels as it gives a more shadow line rather than an incise scoring.

Mr. Roberts brought a sample of the Red Butte sandstone and the color they are proposing. They have had it custom mixed, and is not available anywhere commercially. It is acrylic synthetic stucco and has been approved for other buildings in the historic districts. The four sides of the building will be the same exterior plaster. The quoins, voussoirs, sills and lintels around the windows will have the same element. The shingles are weathered wood asphalt or fiber glass shingles, which is the most popular in the Avenues. In time, the shingles will turn a dark gray to reach the desired color.

This is a simpler and smaller house but still sympathetic to the collectivism of the neighborhood.

The soffits and fascia will be wood, as indicated in the plans. The windows will be aluminum clad wood but will have a low maintenance characteristic. They are all single hung windows except for the big south facing window that is over the grand staircase, it is a fixed window. The windows will be almond or champagne in color and it matches the stucco.

The stucco for the walls will be applied to a wire mesh adhered to plywood. The only part that will have foam will be the projecting lintels and the quoins. All of the stucco will have the same texture and color.

A question came up referencing the color of the stucco possibly being too strong, with potential to over-power the neighborhood. Mr. Roberts indicated the landscaping on the park strip, as well as the yard, should soften the look overtime. The house is on a large hill with a 50 foot drop on the southeast corner and will be the first house built in this area.

Commissioner Lloyd asked about the south elevation.

Mr. Roberts replied that there are two lots that have been combined and now the owner is trying to decide if he wants to sell the southern part. If he does, the south elevation will be ten feet from the property line and ten feet from the next house elevation. This house will sit on a hill and therefore the west part of the south elevation will be seen but not the east part of the south elevation. If setback requirements were met the owner could subdivide the lot and make two conforming lots and build a second house that would be long and narrow. The two lots combined have a frontage of over 100 feet. Each lot is just over 50 feet and would share a driveway. The owner at this time is not sure if he wants to sell.

Commissioner Carl asked about the quoins being a necessary part of the design.

Mr. Roberts indicated that during a period of time, especially during the Roman period, the quoins were better quality and were used to strengthen the corner of buildings; but however, now they are a decorative item used as an impression of stone but made out of wood. The quoins are used all through the neighborhood as decorative pieces.

Commissioner Christensen asked about the doors to the garage and the main entrance.

Mr. Roberts indicated they will all be custom wood.

There being no further questions for Mr. Roberts, the Public Hearings were closed and Commissioner Christensen called for a motion.

Commissioner Lloyd asked that the motion include a condition that the main doors to the garage be wood because they are visible from the street.

Commissioner Hunter indicated that because wood doors can be very expensive, that perhaps they could be included as a recommendation rather than a stipulation.

Commissioner Hunter moved that in Case Number 026-04 at 466 North Wall be approved and that a recommendation for the applicant to use wood doors on the garage if possible. Commissioner Fitzsimmons seconded. All voted "Aye". The motion passed.

Commissioner Christensen called for a five minute recess (4:55). The meeting was called back to order at 5:00 by Commissioner Christensen.

Ms. Giraud presented her Staff Report in memorandum form and indicated that as part of their review, the Utah State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) required comments from the local governments of the municipality in which the property is located. The nominations are then reviewed by the Board of State History prior to being forwarded to the National Park Service, who is responsible for actually listing the property on the National Register.

The Planning Division Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Board of State History to nominate the Seventh-day Adventist Meetinghouse and the Walker Bank Building to the National Register of Historic Places.

A copy of this Memorandum and findings is attached as part of the minutes.

SEVENTH-DAY ADVENTIST MEETINGHOUSE AND SCHOOL

Korral Broschinsky, consultant Preservation Documentation Resource, presented a slide presentation and documentation of the Seventh-day Adventist Meetinghouse and School.

The Seventh-day Adventist Meetinghouse and School was built circa 1928 at 1840 South 800 East. It is a 2 ½-story red brick building on a concrete foundation. The rectangular structure measures approximately 35 by 60 feet. The building faces east with a hipped-roof Prairie School-style front porch support on brick piers.

It was renovated in the 1990s as an artist studio and residency. The studio is on the main floor and the artists live in the basement. This building is unusual, and because it stood out from other churches in the area Ms. Broschinsky chose it to do an intensive level survey form as part of the project she did for Salt Lake City. Earlier in 2006, the owner asked Ms. Broschinsky to prepare a National Register Nomination. The building represents the progress of the Seventh-day Adventists in the twentieth century. It was the main worship space in Salt Lake City for three decades and also housed a day school—one of the Adventist Church's most important programs.

The Seventh-day Adventist Meeting house and School is the oldest known extant Adventist meetinghouse in Utah. It is the only historic building used as a day school that is extant. The architect of the building is unknown, but the use of tiles and the Mission style may have been generated from the west coast offices of the church. This building is an excellent example of the interior layout of a typical church: entrance foyer, worship space, apse (baptismal front) and classrooms in the basement. The building is in excellent condition and contributes to the history of its Salt Lake City Sugarhouse neighborhood.

The Commission then asked questions to Ms. Broschinsky referencing the garage and windows. She explained that the area between the garage and the building does have space to walk between, approximately 3 to 4 feet. The windows have had some changes of glass but the frames are original.

Commissioner Hammond-Heid moved that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Board of State History to nominate the Seventh-day Adventist Meetinghouse and School at 1840 South 800 East to the National Register of Historic Places. Commissioner Hunter seconded. All voted "Aye". The motion passed.

WALKER BANK CENTER BUILDING

Susan Petheram, Planner of Cooper Roberts Simonsen Associates presented a slide presentation and documentation on the Walker Bank Building at 175 North Main Street. The Walker Center Building is a 16-story steel frame skyscraper of the three-part vertical block type. The exterior is clad in granite, terra cotta, and tan brick, and the foundation is granite. Above the 16th story is a three-story tower inset from the main tower, containing the elevator shaft, an observation platform that is 225 feet above the sidewalk level, and the neon Walker Center sign. Construction on the building began in November of 1911 and was completed in 1912. Upon its completion, the building was the tallest in Salt Lake City. The building occupies the northeast corner lot of the Main Street and 200 South Street intersection. The principal façade fronts face west onto Main Street, with the secondary façade facing south on 200 South State. The base part of the building is rectangular in shape with the upper parts above the fifth story forming an "L" shape. Constructed for the Walker Brothers Bank, the building was known as the Walker Bank Building until 1981.

The exterior of the lower part of the building is clad in granite for the first two stories and terra cotta for the third story. The middle part of the building is eleven stories encased with a tan brick. The upper part of the building consists of two stories of terra cotta and the three-story tower covered in terra cotta and brick. A 1956 remodel simplified the entrances giving the façade its current symmetry. The metal canopy was another addition from this remodel, which included work on both the interior and exterior of the building. A secondary entrance for the bank from the south was also removed at this time. The centrally located main entrance to the building was grand in design and detailing. The name of the building and name of the bank were carved into the granite over their respective entrances. In 1931, the name was officially changed to Walker Bank and Trust Company.

The three-story tower has historically been used for the purpose of signage for the Walker Bank, going through three configurations prior to the current one. Each of the signs was illuminated. The first sign had Walker Bank in a single row of letters, affixed to each of the sides of the tower. The next sign for the bank, installed in the mid 1930s, had larger letters in two rows, with Walker being on top of Bank. Probably the most well known of the sign configurations came in the early 1950s. A 90-foot radio tower was erected in 1947 for use by the KDYL radio and television station, the first television station in Utah. A few years later, the television transmitters were moved but the tower remained and on each of the four sides were hung letters to spell out Walker, while Bank was around the perimeter of the top of the tower.

The building is currently undergoing rehabilitation with the majority being interior areas.

Commissioner Carl moved that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Board of State History to nominate the Walker Bank Building at 175 North Main Street to the National Register of Historic Places. Commissioner Hunter seconded. All voted "Aye". The motion passed.

OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Giraud announced a meeting that will be held August 3, 2006 at 5:00 p.m. at the SLC Main Library. The General Services Administration (GSA) is preparing a Supplemental Environmental Assessment (SEA) for the proposed construction of a new 368,000 gross square-foot U.S. Courthouse adjacent to the existing historic Frank E. Moss Courthouse in the Exchange Place Historic District. This is the first presentation of a first phase of the newly design building. Because this is a Federal Courthouse, this Commission is a consulting party, one of six negotiations between the State Preservation Office and the Federal Judicial System. Thomas Phifer, Architect from New York will be at the meeting to present his presentation. This will be a time for not only the Historic Landmark Commission but the Planning Commission and the public to give general comments. She encouraged the Commission to attend.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Louise Harris, Secretary

Scott Christensen, Acting Chairperson