

**Minutes Meeting
Citizens' Compensation Advisory Committee
March 14, 2016**

Members Present: Connie Spyropoulos-Linardakis
John Mathews
Cori Petersen
Dale Cox
Frances Hume (via telephone)

Members Excused: Kerma Jones

Staff Present: David Salazar, City Compensation Administrator
Jodi Langford, City Benefits Administrator
Nancy Torres, Committee Support/Coordinator
Julio Garcia, Human Resources Director
Paige Christensen, Human Resources Consultant

Guests: Lisa Demmons (SLC Association of Firefighters – Local 1645); Trevor Tallon (President, SLC Association of Firefighters – Local 1645); Michael Millard (SLC Police Association)

A recording of these proceedings is on file and available by request from the SLC- HR Department.

Meeting Open & Welcome: Vice-Chair Cori Petersen opened the meeting with a quorum of members present; Frances Hume and (initially) Connie Linardakis participated in the meeting via telephone conference.

Presentation of 2016 U.S. City Public Safety Wage Survey: Michelle Vargas presented members with updated data sheets, including corrected salary information for Salt Lake City, and new presentation slides prepared for the final report. Michelle indicated that she previously presented the Fire and Police union representatives with corrections/updates made to Salt Lake City's response. Lisa Demmons with the Fire union noted a correction was needed in the works hours shown on the data sheet for Fire Captain, which are 56 rather than 40.

Noting the total number of changes made in each of the data sheets, union representatives confirmed the salary and other information indicated for Salt Lake City was correct.

Referring to the set of new presentation slides added to the FirstWest's report, Michelle explained and highlighted the following—

- definition of terms used such as "minimum rate" and "study cities' median." Relative to the median pay rate, Michelle clarified that the median shown is in fact a median of the actual average pay rates reported by each city. Fire union representatives expressed concern about relying on the median of average pay comparison since it does not represent the actual median; Dale Cox reiterated the Committee's decision in the last meeting was to rely instead on actual average pay comparisons since median pay data was not available for consideration;
- pay comparisons used in the study, including actual average pay, top out (maximum) pay rates, etc.;
- explanation of the data source and why cost of living index comparisons were used in the study;
- explanation of how the cost of living index was calculated;
- how wages were compared among cities based on cost of living differences;
- how cost of living impacts salaries, including specific examples; and,
- updated data sheets for each benchmark job included in the survey.

Cori Petersen asked Michelle to update the data sheets to show that the median rates shown are in fact the median of the actual averages reported.

Review and adopt March 2, 2016 meeting minutes: A motion to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 3/2/2016 was made by Dale Cox and seconded by John Mathews. The vote to approve the minutes (with a spelling error correction) was unanimous by all members present.

Presentation & discussion of draft 2016 CCAC Annual Report: David Salazar presented members with an updated copy of the draft 2016 CCAC Annual Report. He noted changes made to the report since emailing a draft to Committee members the week before. He also distributed a copy of the list of Western Management Group survey participants to be included in Appendix B of the report, as well as a copy of the spreadsheet marked as Appendix A.

In addition to discussing changes needed to clarify language in the report, David reviewed and highlighted the various sections of the annual report, including the following—

- most if not all the same format and language used in the report was retained to assist the new Mayor and City Council members' understanding of the content;
- City compensation philosophy, including a reference to the City's turnover rate. Cori Petersen questioned how the turnover rate indicated compared to last year. David explained the primary difference in the number shown, 6.8%, reflects voluntary turnover (including the number of employees who either quit or retired only). The previous year's turnover rate shown in the 2015 annual report was just under 8%, but was a total turnover rate including a count of employees who were dismissed from employment;
- John Mathews asked for references to "benchmarks", "benchmark groups", or "benchmark jobs" be standardized to refer simply as "benchmark jobs";
- in reference to the turnover rate shown, Dale Cox requested that voluntary turnover rates be added to the report (i.e. dismissals);
- when reviewing the current salary budget forecast by type of increase, David noted the addition of a recommendation in the executive summary specifying a range for cost of living or any general increase city leaders may wish to consider;
- pay for performance was discussed by the Committee, including a suggestion to add a statement to further the City's desire to focus on succession planning;
- for benchmark jobs with data from both WCG and WMG survey groups, David explained that a weighted average is shown for benchmarks marked with an asterisk. The weighted average applied gave a 60% weight to the WMG actual average pay rate. Committee members expressed support for this approach.
- John Mathews suggested adding a reference to "recruitment data" as a factor the City rely on when making market data-based compensation decisions;
- the Committee discussed issues and challenges associated with benchmark jobs lagging market significantly; Connie suggested adding a note that indicates the number of lagging benchmarks compared to the previous year;
- remarks and language outlining the third-party (FirstWest) special study and local market comparison for Fire and Police were discussed;
- the Committee discussed information included in a handout showing 2015 recruitment and turnover statistics for Fire & Police.

Dale Cox requested the addition of a table showing the preliminary results of the FirstWest study, including pay comparisons before and after cost of living adjustments were applied.

Jodi Langford provided members with a report with statistics indicating the average years of service, average age and number of Fire, Police, and all other employees separating from city employment.

David highlighted the language used in the section pertaining to Elected Officials, Department Directors & other key city leaders, including incorporation of the Committee's recommendation voted on in the last meeting.

The Committee noted specific changes to the language included in the recommendations in the executive summary.

A motion to approve the annual report with changes noted was made by Cori Petersen and seconded by Connie Linardakis. The vote to approve the motion was unanimous.

This meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:15 PM.

Next Meeting Date: No new meeting date was set.